

# Closable multipliers

Lyudmila Turowska

Chalmers University of Technology and University of  
Gothenburg

(joint with Victor Shulman and Ivan Todorov)

Waterloo, August 9, 2011

# Outline of the Talk

- ▶ Measurable Schur multipliers
- ▶ Local Schur multipliers
- ▶ Closable and  $w^*$ -closable multipliers
- ▶ Toeplitz type multipliers and harmonic analysis.

Integr.Equ.Oper.Theory 69(2011).

# Measurable Schur multipliers

$(X, \mu)$  and  $(Y, \nu)$  standard measure spaces

$$H_1 = L^2(X, \mu), H_2 = L^2(Y, \nu)$$

$\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  the space of all bounded and resp. compact linear operators from  $H_1$  into  $H_2$ .

# Measurable Schur multipliers

$(X, \mu)$  and  $(Y, \nu)$  standard measure spaces

$$H_1 = L^2(X, \mu), H_2 = L^2(Y, \nu)$$

$\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  the space of all bounded and resp. compact linear operators from  $H_1$  into  $H_2$ .

$L_2(X \times Y)$  identify with  $\mathcal{C}_2(H_1, H_2)$ , the space of all Hilbert-Schmidt operators via  $k \mapsto I_k$ ,

$$(I_k f)(y) = \int k(x, y) f(x) d\mu(x).$$

## Measurable Schur multipliers

$(X, \mu)$  and  $(Y, \nu)$  standard measure spaces

$$H_1 = L^2(X, \mu), H_2 = L^2(Y, \nu)$$

$\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  the space of all bounded and resp. compact linear operators from  $H_1$  into  $H_2$ .

$L_2(X \times Y)$  identify with  $\mathcal{C}_2(H_1, H_2)$ , the space of all Hilbert-Schmidt operators via  $k \mapsto I_k$ ,

$$(I_k f)(y) = \int k(x, y) f(x) d\mu(x).$$

Similarly,  $\mathcal{C}_1(H_2, H_1)$ , the space of nuclear operators, will be identified with  $\Gamma(X, Y) = L_2(X) \hat{\otimes} L_2(Y)$ , the space of all  $F : X \times Y \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  s.t.

$$F(x, y) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} f_i(x) g_i(y),$$

$$f_i \in L^2(X, \mu), g_i \in L^2(Y, \nu), \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \|f_i\|_2^2 < \infty, \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \|g_i\|_2^2 < \infty.$$

For measurable complex-valued function  $\varphi$  on  $X \times Y$  define  $S_\varphi$  on  $C_2(H_1, H_2)$  by  $S_\varphi : I_k \mapsto I_{\varphi k}$ .

For measurable complex-valued function  $\varphi$  on  $X \times Y$  define  $S_\varphi$  on  $C_2(H_1, H_2)$  by  $S_\varphi : I_k \mapsto I_\varphi k$ .

$\varphi$  is called a (measurable) **Schur multiplier** if

$$\|S_\varphi(I_k)\|_{\text{op}} \leq C \|I_k\|_{\text{op}}, \forall k \in L_2(X \times Y).$$

For measurable complex-valued function  $\varphi$  on  $X \times Y$  define  $S_\varphi$  on  $C_2(H_1, H_2)$  by  $S_\varphi : I_k \mapsto I_{\varphi k}$ .

$\varphi$  is called a (measurable) **Schur multiplier** if

$$\|S_\varphi(I_k)\|_{\text{op}} \leq C \|I_k\|_{\text{op}}, \forall k \in L_2(X \times Y).$$

$S_\varphi$  has then a unique weak\* continuous extension to  $\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  denoted by  $S_\varphi$ . Let  $\mathfrak{S}(X, Y)$  the set of all Schur multipliers.



For measurable complex-valued function  $\varphi$  on  $X \times Y$  define  $S_\varphi$  on  $C_2(H_1, H_2)$  by  $S_\varphi : I_k \mapsto I_{\varphi k}$ .

$\varphi$  is called a (measurable) **Schur multiplier** if

$$\|S_\varphi(I_k)\|_{\text{op}} \leq C \|I_k\|_{\text{op}}, \forall k \in L_2(X \times Y).$$

$S_\varphi$  has then a unique weak\* continuous extension to  $\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  denoted by  $S_\varphi$ . Let  $\mathfrak{S}(X, Y)$  the set of all Schur multipliers.

### Theorem (Peller)

Let  $\varphi \in L^\infty(X \times Y)$ . TFAE

- (i)  $\varphi$  is a Schur multiplier;
- (ii) there exist measurable functions  $a : X \rightarrow l^2$  and  $b : Y \rightarrow l^2$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi(x, y) &= (a(x), b(y))_{l^2}, \text{ a.e. on } X \times Y \\ &\text{and } \sup_{x \in X} \|a(x)\|_2 \sup_{y \in Y} \|b(y)\|_2 < \infty. \end{aligned}$$

- (iii)  $\varphi(x, y)k(x, y) \in \mu^{\times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)$  whenever  $k(x, y) \in \Gamma(X, Y)$ .

$\varphi$  is a Schur multiplier  $\Rightarrow S_\varphi$  is bounded on  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $L^\infty$ -bimodule, i.e.  $S_\varphi(M_b T M_a) = M_b S_\varphi(T) M_a$ ,  $\forall a \in L^\infty(X)$ ,  $b \in L^\infty(Y)$ .

By the Smith theorem,  $S_\varphi$  is a cb map and  $S_\varphi(T) = \sum_i M_{b_i} T M_{a_i}$  where  $\sum a_i(x) b_i(y) = (a(x), b(y))_{l^2} \in L^\infty(X) \otimes_{eh} L^\infty(Y)$  and hence  $\varphi(x, y) = (a(x), b(y))_{l^2}$ .

$\varphi$  is a Schur multiplier  $\Rightarrow S_\varphi$  is bounded on  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $L^\infty$ -bimodule, i.e.  $S_\varphi(M_b T M_a) = M_b S_\varphi(T) M_a$ ,  $\forall a \in L^\infty(X)$ ,  $b \in L^\infty(Y)$ .

By the Smith theorem,  $S_\varphi$  is a cb map and  $S_\varphi(T) = \sum_i M_{b_i} T M_{a_i}$  where  $\sum a_i(x) b_i(y) = (a(x), b(y))_{l^2} \in L^\infty(X) \otimes_{eh} L^\infty(Y)$  and hence  $\varphi(x, y) = (a(x), b(y))_{l^2}$ .

- Non-Schur multiplier: Transformer of triangular truncation  $\varphi(x, y) = \chi_\Delta(x, y)$ , where  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1]^2 : x \leq y\}$  (Gohberg-Krein)

$\varphi$  is a Schur multiplier  $\Rightarrow S_\varphi$  is bounded on  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $L^\infty$ -bimodule, i.e.  $S_\varphi(M_b T M_a) = M_b S_\varphi(T) M_a$ ,  $\forall a \in L^\infty(X)$ ,  $b \in L^\infty(Y)$ .

By the Smith theorem,  $S_\varphi$  is a cb map and  $S_\varphi(T) = \sum_i M_{b_i} T M_{a_i}$  where  $\sum a_i(x) b_i(y) = (a(x), b(y))_{l^2} \in L^\infty(X) \otimes_{eh} L^\infty(Y)$  and hence  $\varphi(x, y) = (a(x), b(y))_{l^2}$ .

- Non-Schur multiplier: Transformer of triangular truncation  $\varphi(x, y) = \chi_\Delta(x, y)$ , where  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1]^2 : x \leq y\}$  (Gohberg-Krein)

## Theorem (Bozejko)

Let  $G$  be a locally compact amenable group with Haar measure  $m$  and  $\varphi(x, y) = f(xy^{-1})$ , where  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ .

Then  $\varphi$  is a Schur multiplier (w.r.t.  $m$ ) iff  $f \in B(G)$  (the Fourier Stieltjes algebra of  $G$ ).

Obs! We have  $B(G) = \{f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C} : fA(G) \subset A(G)\} = MA(G)$ .

# Local Schur multipliers

A function  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$  is called a **local Schur multiplier** if there exists a covering family  $\{\kappa_m\}_{m=1}^{\infty}$  of rectangles in  $X \times Y$  (i.e.  $X \times Y = \bigcup \kappa_m$ ) s.t.  $\varphi|_{\kappa_m}$  is a Schur multiplier for each  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ .  
 $\mathfrak{S}_{\text{loc}}(X, Y)$  the set of all local Schur multipliers.

# Local Schur multipliers

A function  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$  is called a **local Schur multiplier** if there exists a covering family  $\{\kappa_m\}_{m=1}^{\infty}$  of rectangles in  $X \times Y$  (i.e.  $X \times Y = \cup \kappa_m$ ) s.t.  $\varphi|_{\kappa_m}$  is a Schur multiplier for each  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ .  
 $\mathfrak{S}_{\text{loc}}(X, Y)$  the set of all local Schur multipliers.

## Theorem

*TFAE*

- (i)  $\varphi$  is a local Schur multiplier;
- (ii) there exist measurable functions  $a : X \rightarrow l^2$  and  $b : Y \rightarrow l^2$  such that

$$\begin{aligned}\varphi(x, y) &= (a(x), b(y))_{l^2}, \text{ a.e. on } X \times Y \text{ and} \\ \|a(x)\|_2 &< \infty \text{ a.e. on } X, \|b(y)\|_2 < \infty \text{ a.e. on } Y.\end{aligned}$$

## $w^*$ -closable and closable multipliers

For  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$ , consider  $S_\varphi$  as (densely defined linear) map on  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  ( $D(S_\varphi) \subset \mathcal{C}_2(H_1, H_2) \subset \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$ ).

## $w^*$ -closable and closable multipliers

For  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$ , consider  $S_\varphi$  as (densely defined linear) map on  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  ( $D(S_\varphi) \subset \mathcal{C}_2(H_1, H_2) \subset \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$ ).

$\varphi$  is called a **closable multiplier** if the map  $S_\varphi$  is closable, i.e. if  $(x_k)_{k \in \mathbb{N}} \subseteq D(S_\varphi)$ ,  $\|x_k\| \rightarrow 0$  and  $\|S_\varphi(x_k) - y\| \rightarrow 0$  imply that  $y = 0$ .



## $w^*$ -closable and closable multipliers

For  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$ , consider  $S_\varphi$  as (densely defined linear) map on  $\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$  ( $D(S_\varphi) \subset \mathcal{C}_2(H_1, H_2) \subset \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2)$ ).

$\varphi$  is called a **closable multiplier** if the map  $S_\varphi$  is closable, i.e. if  $(x_k)_{k \in \mathbb{N}} \subseteq D(S_\varphi)$ ,  $\|x_k\| \rightarrow 0$  and  $\|S_\varphi(x_k) - y\| \rightarrow 0$  imply that  $y = 0$ .

Similarly,  $\varphi$  is called a **weak\* closable multiplier** if  $S_\varphi$  is weak\* closable as map on  $\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$ , i.e. if  $(x_i) \subseteq D(S_\varphi)$ ,  $x_i \xrightarrow{w^*} 0$  in  $\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  and  $S_\varphi(x_i) \xrightarrow{w^*} y$  in  $\mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  imply  $y = 0$ .

Denote these classes of functions by  $\mathfrak{S}_{\text{cl}}(X, Y)$  and  $\mathfrak{S}_{w^*}(X, Y)$ , resp.

- ▶  $S_\varphi^*$  is a map on  $(\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2))^* \simeq \Gamma(X, Y)$ ,  $S_\varphi^* : k \mapsto \varphi k$  with domain  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .

- ▶  $S_\varphi^*$  is a map on  $(\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2))^* \simeq \Gamma(X, Y)$ ,  $S_\varphi^* : k \mapsto \varphi k$  with domain  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .
- ▶ **Fact:**  $S_\varphi$  is  $w^*$ -closable (closable) iff  $\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{\|\cdot\|} = \Gamma(X, Y)$  (resp.  $\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{w^*} = \Gamma(X, Y)$ ).

- ▶  $S_\varphi^*$  is a map on  $(\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2))^* \simeq \Gamma(X, Y)$ ,  $S_\varphi^* : k \mapsto \varphi k$  with domain  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .
- ▶ **Fact:**  $S_\varphi$  is  $w^*$ -closable (closable) iff  $\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{\|\cdot\|} = \Gamma(X, Y)$  (resp.  $\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{w^*} = \Gamma(X, Y)$ ).

## Lemma

Let  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$ . TFAE:

- (i)  $\varphi$  is a  $w^*$ -closable multiplier;
- (ii)  $\exists$  rectangles  $\{\kappa_m\}_{m \in \mathbb{N}}$ ,  $\cup k_m = X \times Y$ , and  $\exists s_m, t_m \in \Gamma(X, Y)$  s.t.  $s_m(x, y) \neq 0$  m.a.e. on  $\kappa_m$  and

$$\varphi(x, y) = \frac{t_m(x, y)}{s_m(x, y)}, \quad \text{a.e. on } \kappa_m, \quad m \in \mathbb{N}.$$

- ▶  $S_\varphi^*$  is a map on  $(\mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2))^* \simeq \Gamma(X, Y)$ ,  $S_\varphi^* : k \mapsto \varphi k$  with domain  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .
- ▶ **Fact:**  $S_\varphi$  is  $w^*$ -closable (closable) iff  $\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{\|\cdot\|} = \Gamma(X, Y)$  (resp.  $\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{w^*} = \Gamma(X, Y)$ ).

## Lemma

Let  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$ . TFAE:

- (i)  $\varphi$  is a  $w^*$ -closable multiplier;
- (ii)  $\exists$  rectangles  $\{\kappa_m\}_{m \in \mathbb{N}}$ ,  $\cup \kappa_m = X \times Y$ , and  $\exists s_m, t_m \in \Gamma(X, Y)$  s.t.  $s_m(x, y) \neq 0$  m.a.e. on  $\kappa_m$  and

$$\varphi(x, y) = \frac{t_m(x, y)}{s_m(x, y)}, \quad \text{a.e. on } \kappa_m, \quad m \in \mathbb{N}.$$

## Theorem

A function  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$  is a  $w^*$ -closable multiplier iff  $\exists t, s \in \mathfrak{S}_{loc}(X, Y)$  s.t.  $s(x, y) \neq 0$  m.a.e. on  $X \times Y$  and  $\varphi(x, y) = \frac{t(x, y)}{s(x, y)}$ , a.e. on  $X \times Y$ .

- ▶ Hence  $\mathfrak{S}(X, Y) \subset \mathfrak{S}_{loc}(X, Y) \subset \mathfrak{S}_{w^*}(X, Y) \subset \mathfrak{S}_{cl}(X, Y)$ .
- ▶ Clearly,  $\mathfrak{S}(X, Y) \subset \mathfrak{S}_{loc}(X, Y)$  is proper. We will see that  $\mathfrak{S}_{w^*}(X, Y) \subset \mathfrak{S}_{cl}(X, Y)$  is proper.
- ▶ **OPEN:** Is the inclusion  $\mathfrak{S}_{loc}(X, Y) \subset \mathfrak{S}_{w^*}(X, Y)$  proper?

# Non-closable multiplier

## Example

Example is based on result on non-validity of generalized Fuglede-Putnam theorem on the set of compact operators.

Namely,  $\exists T \in \mathcal{K}(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$ ,  $f_n, g_n \in L^\infty(\mathbb{T})$  s.t. for

$$\psi(t, s) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} f_n(t) g_n(s) \in \mathfrak{S}(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T})$$

$$S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0 \text{ and } S_{\overline{\psi}}(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{\overline{f_n}} T M_{\overline{g_n}} \neq 0,$$

# Non-closable multiplier

## Example

Example is based on result on non-validity of generalized Fuglede-Putnam theorem on the set of compact operators.

Namely,  $\exists T \in \mathcal{K}(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$ ,  $f_n, g_n \in L^\infty(\mathbb{T})$  s.t. for

$$\psi(t, s) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} f_n(t) g_n(s) \in \mathfrak{S}(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T})$$

$$S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0 \text{ and } S_{\overline{\psi}}(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{\overline{f_n}} T M_{\overline{g_n}} \neq 0,$$

Let  $\varphi(t, s) = \overline{\frac{\psi(t, s)}{\psi(t, s)}}$  if  $\psi(t, s) \neq 0$  and  $\varphi(t, s) = 0$  otherwise.



# Non-closable multiplier

## Example

Example is based on result on non-validity of generalized Fuglede-Putnam theorem on the set of compact operators.

Namely,  $\exists T \in \mathcal{K}(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$ ,  $f_n, g_n \in L^\infty(\mathbb{T})$  s.t. for

$$\psi(t, s) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} f_n(t) g_n(s) \in \mathfrak{S}(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T})$$

$$S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0 \text{ and } S_{\overline{\psi}}(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{\overline{f_n}} T M_{\overline{g_n}} \neq 0,$$

Let  $\varphi(t, s) = \frac{\overline{\psi(t, s)}}{\psi(t, s)}$  if  $\psi(t, s) \neq 0$  and  $\varphi(t, s) = 0$  otherwise.

**Claim:**  $\varphi$  is not closable.

# Non-closable multiplier

## Example

Example is based on result on non-validity of generalized Fuglede-Putnam theorem on the set of compact operators.

Namely,  $\exists T \in \mathcal{K}(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$ ,  $f_n, g_n \in L^\infty(\mathbb{T})$  s.t. for  $\psi(t, s) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} f_n(t) g_n(s) \in \mathfrak{S}(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T})$

$$S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0 \text{ and } S_{\overline{\psi}}(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{\overline{f_n}} T M_{\overline{g_n}} \neq 0,$$

Let  $\varphi(t, s) = \frac{\overline{\psi(t, s)}}{\psi(t, s)}$  if  $\psi(t, s) \neq 0$  and  $\varphi(t, s) = 0$  otherwise.

**Claim:**  $\varphi$  is not closable.

Let  $\{T_n\}_{n=1}^\infty \subseteq \mathcal{C}_2(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$  s.t.  $T_n \rightarrow T$  in the operator norm.  
Then  $S_\psi(T_n) \rightarrow S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0$ .

# Non-closable multiplier

## Example

Example is based on result on non-validity of generalized Fuglede-Putnam theorem on the set of compact operators.

Namely,  $\exists T \in \mathcal{K}(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$ ,  $f_n, g_n \in L^\infty(\mathbb{T})$  s.t. for

$$\psi(t, s) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} f_n(t) g_n(s) \in \mathfrak{S}(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T})$$

$$S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0 \text{ and } S_{\overline{\psi}}(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{\overline{f_n}} T M_{\overline{g_n}} \neq 0,$$

Let  $\varphi(t, s) = \overline{\psi(t, s)}$  if  $\psi(t, s) \neq 0$  and  $\varphi(t, s) = 0$  otherwise.

**Claim:**  $\varphi$  is not closable.

Let  $\{T_n\}_{n=1}^\infty \subseteq \mathcal{C}_2(L^2(\mathbb{T}))$  s.t.  $T_n \rightarrow T$  in the operator norm.

Then  $S_\psi(T_n) \rightarrow S_\psi(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{f_n} T M_{g_n} = 0$ . However,

$$S_\varphi(S_\psi(T_n)) = S_{\overline{\psi}}(T_n) \rightarrow S_{\overline{\psi}}(T) = \sum_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} M_{\overline{f_n}} T M_{\overline{g_n}} \neq 0.$$

## Closable multipliers and $M$ -sets.

- ▶  **$\omega$ -topology:**  $E \subseteq X \times Y$  is marginally null if  
 $E \subseteq (X_0 \times Y) \cup (X \times Y_0)$ ,  $\mu(X_0) = \nu(Y_0) = 0$ .  
 $E$  is  $\omega$ -open if  $E = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \alpha_n \times \beta_n$ ,  $(\omega\text{-open})^c = \omega\text{-closed}$ .

# Closable multipliers and $M$ -sets.

- ▶  **$\omega$ -topology:**  $E \subseteq X \times Y$  is marginally null if  $E \subseteq (X_0 \times Y) \cup (X \times Y_0)$ ,  $\mu(X_0) = \nu(Y_0) = 0$ .  
 $E$  is  $\omega$ -open if  $E = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \alpha_n \times \beta_n$ ,  $(\omega\text{-open})^c = \omega\text{-closed}$ .
- ▶  $\omega$ -closed  $\kappa \subseteq X \times Y$  **supports**  $T \in \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  if  $M_{\chi\beta} T M_{\chi\alpha} = 0$  whenever  $\alpha \times \beta \cap \kappa \simeq \emptyset$ .

For any  $\mathcal{M} \subseteq \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$ ,  $\exists$  a smallest (up to marginal equivalence)  $\omega$ -closed set  $\text{supp } \mathcal{M}$  which supports  $\forall T \in \mathcal{M}$ .

## Closable multipliers and $M$ -sets.

- ▶  **$\omega$ -topology:**  $E \subseteq X \times Y$  is marginally null if  $E \subseteq (X_0 \times Y) \cup (X \times Y_0)$ ,  $\mu(X_0) = \nu(Y_0) = 0$ .  
 $E$  is  $\omega$ -open if  $E = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \alpha_n \times \beta_n$ ,  $(\omega\text{-open})^c = \omega\text{-closed}$ .

- ▶  $\omega$ -closed  $\kappa \subseteq X \times Y$  **supports**  $T \in \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  if  $M_{\chi\beta} T M_{\chi\alpha} = 0$  whenever  $\alpha \times \beta \cap \kappa \simeq \emptyset$ .

For any  $\mathcal{M} \subseteq \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$ ,  $\exists$  a smallest (up to marginal equivalence)  $\omega$ -closed set  $\text{supp } \mathcal{M}$  which supports  $\forall T \in \mathcal{M}$ .

- ▶ For any  $\omega$ -closed set  $\kappa \exists$  a smallest (resp. largest)  $w^*$ -closed  $L_{\infty}(X)$ - $L_{\infty}(Y)$ -bimodule  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa)$  (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa)$ ) with support  $\kappa$ , i.e. if  $\mathfrak{M} \subseteq \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  is a  $w^*$ -closed bimodule with  $\text{supp } \mathfrak{M} = \kappa$  then

$$\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa) \subseteq \mathfrak{M} \subseteq \mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa).$$

## Closable multipliers and $M$ -sets.

- ▶  **$\omega$ -topology:**  $E \subseteq X \times Y$  is marginally null if  $E \subseteq (X_0 \times Y) \cup (X \times Y_0)$ ,  $\mu(X_0) = \nu(Y_0) = 0$ .  
 $E$  is  $\omega$ -open if  $E = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \alpha_n \times \beta_n$ ,  $(\omega\text{-open})^c = \omega\text{-closed}$ .

- ▶  $\omega$ -closed  $\kappa \subseteq X \times Y$  **supports**  $T \in \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  if  $M_{\chi\beta} T M_{\chi\alpha} = 0$  whenever  $\alpha \times \beta \cap \kappa \simeq \emptyset$ .

For any  $\mathcal{M} \subseteq \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$ ,  $\exists$  a smallest (up to marginal equivalence)  $\omega$ -closed set  $\text{supp } \mathcal{M}$  which supports  $\forall T \in \mathcal{M}$ .

- ▶ For any  $\omega$ -closed set  $\kappa \exists$  a smallest (resp. largest)  $w^*$ -closed  $L_{\infty}(X)$ - $L_{\infty}(Y)$ -bimodule  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa)$  (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa)$ ) with support  $\kappa$ , i.e. if  $\mathfrak{M} \subseteq \mathcal{B}(H_1, H_2)$  is a  $w^*$ -closed bimodule with  $\text{supp } \mathfrak{M} = \kappa$  then

$$\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa) \subseteq \mathfrak{M} \subseteq \mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa).$$

- ▶ If  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa) = \mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa)$ , the set  $\kappa$  is called *synthetic*.

## Fact:

$S_\varphi$  is closable iff

$$\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{w^*} = \Gamma(X, Y) \Leftrightarrow D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp \cap \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2) = \{0\},$$

where  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .



## Fact:

$S_\varphi$  is closable iff

$$\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{w^*} = \Gamma(X, Y) \Leftrightarrow D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp \cap \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2) = \{0\},$$

where  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .

Let  $\text{null } D(S_\varphi^*) = \kappa_\varphi$ .

$D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp = \{T \in B(H_1, H_2) : \text{Tr}(TS) = 0, \forall S \in D(S_\varphi^*)\}$  is a  $w^*$ -closed bimodule supported by  $\kappa_\varphi$ . Hence

$$\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa_\varphi) \subseteq D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp \subseteq \mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa_\varphi).$$

## Fact:

$S_\varphi$  is closable iff

$$\overline{D(S_\varphi^*)}^{w^*} = \Gamma(X, Y) \Leftrightarrow D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp \cap \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2) = \{0\},$$

where  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{k \in \Gamma(X, Y) : \varphi k \in {}^{\mu \times \nu} \Gamma(X, Y)\}$ .

Let  $\text{null } D(S_\varphi^*) = \kappa_\varphi$ .

$D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp = \{T \in B(H_1, H_2) : \text{Tr}(TS) = 0, \forall S \in D(S_\varphi^*)\}$  is a  $w^*$ -closed bimodule supported by  $\kappa_\varphi$ . Hence

$$\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(\kappa_\varphi) \subseteq D(S_\varphi^*)^\perp \subseteq \mathfrak{M}_{\max}(\kappa_\varphi).$$

Following the analogy with harmonic analysis initiated by Arveson and later pursued by Froelich, we call an  $\omega$ -closed set  $E \subseteq X \times Y$  an **operator  $M$ -set** (respectively, **operator  $M_1$ -set**) if  $E$  supports a non-zero compact operator (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(E)$  contains a non-zero compact operator).

## Theorem

Let  $\varphi \in \mathfrak{B}(X \times Y)$ .

- (i) If  $\kappa_\varphi$  is not an operator  $M$ -set then  $\varphi$  is a closable multiplier.
- (ii) If  $\kappa_\varphi$  is an operator  $M_1$ -set then  $\varphi$  is not a closable multiplier.

## Closable multipliers

Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1] \times [0, 1] : x \leq y\}$ . By result of Gohberg-Krein  $\chi_\Delta$  is not a Schur multiplier.

## Closable multipliers

Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1] \times [0, 1] : x \leq y\}$ . By result of Gohberg-Krein  $\chi_\Delta$  is not a Schur multiplier.

### Claim

$\chi_\Delta$  is closable but not  $w^*$ -closable.

## Closable multipliers

Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1] \times [0, 1] : x \leq y\}$ . By result of Gohberg-Krein  $\chi_\Delta$  is not a Schur multiplier.

### Claim

$\chi_\Delta$  is closable but not  $w^*$ -closable.

**Idea:**  $\chi_\Delta$  is closable: In fact, as  $\chi_\Delta$  is constant on each rectangle disjoint from  $\Lambda = \{(x, x) : x \in [0, 1]\}$ , null  $D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*) \subset \Lambda$ .

# Closable multipliers

Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1] \times [0, 1] : x \leq y\}$ . By result of Gohberg-Krein  $\chi_\Delta$  is not a Schur multiplier.

## Claim

$\chi_\Delta$  is closable but not  $w^*$ -closable.

**Idea:**  $\chi_\Delta$  is closable: In fact, as  $\chi_\Delta$  is constant on each rectangle disjoint from  $\Lambda = \{(x, x) : x \in [0, 1]\}$ ,  $\text{null } D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*) \subset \Lambda$ .

$\Lambda$  only supports operators  $M_f$ ,  $f \in L^\infty(0, 1)$ , as

$\text{supp } T \subset \Lambda \Leftrightarrow M_{\chi_\alpha^c} T M_{\chi_\alpha} \forall \alpha \subset [0, 1] \Leftrightarrow [T, M_\alpha] = 0, \forall \alpha$  ; in

particular, it is not an operator  $M$ -set, hence

$D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*)^\perp \cap \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2) = \{0\}$ .

# Closable multipliers

Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1] \times [0, 1] : x \leq y\}$ . By result of Gohberg-Krein  $\chi_\Delta$  is not a Schur multiplier.

## Claim

$\chi_\Delta$  is closable but not  $w^*$ -closable.

**Idea:**  $\chi_\Delta$  is closable: In fact, as  $\chi_\Delta$  is constant on each rectangle disjoint from  $\Lambda = \{(x, x) : x \in [0, 1]\}$ ,  $\text{null } D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*) \subset \Lambda$ .

$\Lambda$  only supports operators  $M_f$ ,  $f \in L^\infty(0, 1)$ , as

$\text{supp } T \subset \Lambda \Leftrightarrow M_{\chi_\alpha^c} T M_{\chi_\alpha} \forall \alpha \subset [0, 1] \Leftrightarrow [T, M_\alpha] = 0, \forall \alpha$ ; in

particular, it is not an operator  $M$ -set, hence

$$D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*)^\perp \cap \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2) = \{0\}.$$

$\chi_\Delta$  is not  $\omega$ -continuous while  $w^*$ -closable multipliers are.



# Closable multipliers

Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in [0, 1] \times [0, 1] : x \leq y\}$ . By result of Gohberg-Krein  $\chi_\Delta$  is not a Schur multiplier.

## Claim

$\chi_\Delta$  is closable but not  $w^*$ -closable.

**Idea:**  $\chi_\Delta$  is closable: In fact, as  $\chi_\Delta$  is constant on each rectangle disjoint from  $\Lambda = \{(x, x) : x \in [0, 1]\}$ ,  $\text{null } D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*) \subset \Lambda$ .

$\Lambda$  only supports operators  $M_f$ ,  $f \in L^\infty(0, 1)$ , as

$\text{supp } T \subset \Lambda \Leftrightarrow M_{\chi_{\alpha^c}} T M_{\chi_\alpha} \forall \alpha \subset [0, 1] \Leftrightarrow [T, M_\alpha] = 0, \forall \alpha$ ; in particular, it is not an operator  $M$ -set, hence

$$D(S_{\chi_\Delta}^*)^\perp \cap \mathcal{K}(H_1, H_2) = \{0\}.$$

$\chi_\Delta$  is not  $\omega$ -continuous while  $w^*$ -closable multipliers are.

## Theorem (Shulman)

Let  $E = \{(x, y) : f_j(x) \leq g_j(y), \text{ for } j = 1, \dots, n.\}$ ,  $f_j : X \rightarrow Z$ ,  $g_j : Y \rightarrow Z$ ,  $Z$  ordered metric space.  $E$  is not an  $M$ -set iff  $\mu \times \nu(E) = 0$ ;

# Multipliers of Toeplitz type

- ▶  $G$  is a locally compact second countable group,  $\mu = ds$  is the left invariant Haar measure on  $G$ .
- ▶  $A(G)$  (resp.  $B(G)$ ) is the Fourier (resp. the Fourier-Stieltjes) algebra of  $G$ .

# Multipliers of Toeplitz type

- ▶  $G$  is a locally compact second countable group,  $\mu = ds$  is the left invariant Haar measure on  $G$ .
- ▶  $A(G)$  (resp.  $B(G)$ ) is the Fourier (resp. the Fourier-Stieltjes) algebra of  $G$ .
- ▶ We say that  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  belongs (resp. almost belongs) to  $A(G)$  at  $t \in G$  if  $\exists$  nbhd  $U$  of  $t$  and  $g \in A(G)$  s.t.  $f(s) = g(s)$  everywhere (resp. a.e.) on  $U$ .
- ▶ If  $f$  belongs to  $A(G)$  at each  $t \in G$  then we say that  $f$  **locally belongs** to  $A(G)$  ( $f \in A(G)^{\text{loc}}$ ).

$A(G)^{\text{loc}} \subseteq C(G)$  and if  $G$  is compact then  $A(G)^{\text{loc}} = A(G)$ .

In general,

$$A(G) \subseteq B(G) \subseteq A(G)^{\text{loc}}.$$

For  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  let  $Nf : G \times G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be given by  $Nf(s, t) = f(st^{-1})$ , function of Toeplitz type.

**Q.** For which  $f$  is  $Nf$  a local Schur multiplier,  $w^*$ -closable and closable multiplier?

For  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  let  $Nf : G \times G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be given by  $Nf(s, t) = f(st^{-1})$ , function of Toeplitz type.

**Q.** For which  $f$  is  $Nf$  a local Schur multiplier,  $w^*$ -closable and closable multiplier?

### Theorem (Bozejko)

*Let  $G$  be amenable. If  $f \in L^\infty(G)$  then  $Nf$  is a Schur multiplier iff  $f \in {}^\mu B(G) = MA(G)$ , i.e.  $J_f = \{h \in A(G) : fh \in {}^\mu A(G)\} = A(G)$ .*

For  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  let  $Nf : G \times G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be given by  $Nf(s, t) = f(st^{-1})$ , function of Toeplitz type.

**Q.** For which  $f$  is  $Nf$  a local Schur multiplier,  $w^*$ -closable and closable multiplier?

### Theorem (Bozejko)

*Let  $G$  be amenable. If  $f \in L^\infty(G)$  then  $Nf$  is a Schur multiplier iff  $f \in {}^\mu B(G) = MA(G)$ , i.e.  $J_f = \{h \in A(G) : fh \in {}^\mu A(G)\} = A(G)$ .*

### Lemma

*Let  $E_f = \{t \in G : f \text{ does not almost belong to } A(G) \text{ at } t\}$ .  
Then  $\text{null } D(S_{Nf}^*) = E_f^* := \{(s, t) : st^{-1} \in E_f\}$*

### Theorem

*Let  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be a measurable function and  $\varphi = Nf$ . TFAE*

- (i)  $f \in {}^\mu A(G)^{\text{loc}}$ ;*
- (ii)  $\varphi$  is a local Schur multiplier;*
- (iii)  $\varphi$  is a  $w^*$ -closable multiplier.*

## Example

- ▶ Let  $\Delta = \{(x, y) \in \mathbb{R}^2 : x \leq y\}$ . Then  $\chi_\Delta(x, y) = \chi_{(-\infty, 0]}(x - y)$  is not a  $w^*$ -closable multiplier, since  $\chi_{(-\infty, 0]}$  does not almost belong to  $A(\mathbb{R})$  at  $x = 0$ .
- ▶ There exists non-closable extremely non-Schur multiplier  $\varphi$ , i.e.  $D(S_\varphi^*) = \{0\}$ .  
In fact,  $\forall S \subset \mathbb{T}$ ,  $\mu(S) = 0$ ,  $\exists f \in C(\mathbb{T})$ , whose Fourier series diverges  $\forall t \in S$ . Choose  $S$  to be dense in  $\mathbb{T}$ . Then  $\mathbb{T} = E_f$  and hence null  $D(S_{Nf}^*) = \mathbb{T}^2$ .

# M-sets in harmonic analysis and closability of Toeplitz type multipliers

Assume  $G$  is a compact abelian, so that  $\hat{G}$  is discrete. Then

$$A(G) = \left\{ \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} c_{\chi} \chi : \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} |c_{\chi}| < \infty \right\}.$$

The space of pseudomeasures  $PM(G) = A(G)^*$  identified with  $\ell^{\infty}(\hat{G})$  via Fourier transform:  $F \rightarrow \{\hat{F}(\chi)\}_{\chi \in \hat{G}}$ .



# M-sets in harmonic analysis and closability of Toeplitz type multipliers

Assume  $G$  is a compact abelian, so that  $\hat{G}$  is discrete. Then

$$A(G) = \left\{ \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} c_{\chi} \chi : \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} |c_{\chi}| < \infty \right\}.$$

The space of pseudomeasures  $PM(G) = A(G)^*$  identified with  $\ell^{\infty}(\hat{G})$  via Fourier transform:  $F \rightarrow \{\hat{F}(\chi)\}_{\chi \in \hat{G}}$ .

$F \in PM(G)$  is called a **pseudofunction** if  $\hat{F}$  vanishes at infinity.

The support  $\text{supp } F$  of  $F \in PM(G)$  is the set  $\{x \in G : fF \neq 0 \text{ whenever } f(x) \neq 0, f \in A(G)\}$ .

# M-sets in harmonic analysis and closability of Toeplitz type multipliers

Assume  $G$  is a compact abelian, so that  $\hat{G}$  is discrete. Then

$$A(G) = \left\{ \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} c_{\chi} \chi : \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} |c_{\chi}| < \infty \right\}.$$

The space of pseudomeasures  $PM(G) = A(G)^*$  identified with  $\ell^{\infty}(\hat{G})$  via Fourier transform:  $F \rightarrow \{\hat{F}(\chi)\}_{\chi \in \hat{G}}$ .

$F \in PM(G)$  is called a **pseudofunction** if  $\hat{F}$  vanishes at infinity.

The support  $\text{supp } F$  of  $F \in PM(G)$  is the set

$\{x \in G : fF \neq 0 \text{ whenever } f(x) \neq 0, f \in A(G)\}.$

$$PM(E) = \{F \in PM(G) : \text{supp } F \subset E\},$$
$$N(E) = \overline{\{\text{measures } \mu \in M(G) : \text{supp } \mu \subset E\}}^{w^*}$$

# M-sets in harmonic analysis and closability of Toeplitz type multipliers

Assume  $G$  is a compact abelian, so that  $\hat{G}$  is discrete. Then

$$A(G) = \left\{ \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} c_{\chi} \chi : \sum_{\chi \in \Gamma} |c_{\chi}| < \infty \right\}.$$

The space of pseudomeasures  $PM(G) = A(G)^*$  identified with  $\ell^{\infty}(\hat{G})$  via Fourier transform:  $F \rightarrow \{\hat{F}(\chi)\}_{\chi \in \hat{G}}$ .

$F \in PM(G)$  is called a **pseudofunction** if  $\hat{F}$  vanishes at infinity.

The support  $\text{supp } F$  of  $F \in PM(G)$  is the set

$\{x \in G : fF \neq 0 \text{ whenever } f(x) \neq 0, f \in A(G)\}.$

$$PM(E) = \{F \in PM(G) : \text{supp } F \subset E\},$$
$$N(E) = \overline{\{\text{measures } \mu \in M(G) : \text{supp } \mu \subset E\}}^{w*}$$

$PM(E)$  (resp.  $N(E)$ ) is the largest (resp. smallest) weak\* closed subspace the support of whose every element is in  $E$ .

- ▶ A closed set  $E \subseteq G$  is called an  **$M$ -set** (resp. an  **$M_1$ -set**) if  $PM(E)$  (resp.  $N(E)$ ) contains a non-zero pseudofunction.  $\exists$  an  $M$ -set which is not an  $M_1$ -set.
- ▶ Recall that  $E \subseteq G \times G$  an *operator  $M$ -set* (respectively, *operator  $M_1$ -set*) if  $E$  supports a non-zero compact operator (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(E)$  contains a non-zero compact operator).

- ▶ A closed set  $E \subseteq G$  is called an ***M-set*** (resp. an ***M<sub>1</sub>-set***) if  $PM(E)$  (resp.  $N(E)$ ) contains a non-zero pseudofunction.  $\exists$  an *M-set* which is not an *M<sub>1</sub>-set*.
- ▶ Recall that  $E \subseteq G \times G$  an *operator M-set* (respectively, *operator M<sub>1</sub>-set*) if  $E$  supports a non-zero compact operator (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(E)$  contains a non-zero compact operator).

For  $E \subseteq G$ , we let  $E^* = \{(s, t) \in G \times G : ts^{-1} \in E\}$ .

## Theorem

Let  $E \subseteq G$  be a closed set.

- (i)  $E$  is an *M-set* iff  $E^*$  is an *operator M-set*;
- (ii)  $E$  is an *M<sub>1</sub>-set* iff  $E^*$  is an *operator M<sub>1</sub>-set*.

- ▶ A closed set  $E \subseteq G$  is called an  **$M$ -set** (resp. an  **$M_1$ -set**) if  $PM(E)$  (resp.  $N(E)$ ) contains a non-zero pseudofunction.  $\exists$  an  $M$ -set which is not an  $M_1$ -set.
- ▶ Recall that  $E \subseteq G \times G$  an *operator  $M$ -set* (respectively, *operator  $M_1$ -set*) if  $E$  supports a non-zero compact operator (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(E)$  contains a non-zero compact operator).

For  $E \subseteq G$ , we let  $E^* = \{(s, t) \in G \times G : ts^{-1} \in E\}$ .

## Theorem

Let  $E \subseteq G$  be a closed set.

- (i)  $E$  is an  $M$ -set iff  $E^*$  is an operator  $M$ -set;
- (ii)  $E$  is an  $M_1$ -set iff  $E^*$  is an operator  $M_1$ -set.

Theorem holds for amenable groups if we define  $M$ -set (resp.  $M_1$ -set) as such  $E \subset G$  that  $E$  supports a non-zero  $a \in C_r^*(G) \subset VN(G)$  (resp.  $\exists a \neq 0$  in  $C_r^*(G)$ ,  $a \in I(E)^\perp$ ).

- ▶ A closed set  $E \subseteq G$  is called an  **$M$ -set** (resp. an  **$M_1$ -set**) if  $PM(E)$  (resp.  $N(E)$ ) contains a non-zero pseudofunction.  $\exists$  an  $M$ -set which is not an  $M_1$ -set.
- ▶ Recall that  $E \subseteq G \times G$  an *operator*  $M$ -set (respectively, *operator*  $M_1$ -set) if  $E$  supports a non-zero compact operator (resp.  $\mathfrak{M}_{\min}(E)$  contains a non-zero compact operator).

For  $E \subseteq G$ , we let  $E^* = \{(s, t) \in G \times G : ts^{-1} \in E\}$ .

## Theorem

Let  $E \subseteq G$  be a closed set.

- (i)  $E$  is an  $M$ -set iff  $E^*$  is an operator  $M$ -set;
- (ii)  $E$  is an  $M_1$ -set iff  $E^*$  is an operator  $M_1$ -set.

Theorem holds for amenable groups if we define  $M$ -set (resp.  $M_1$ -set) as such  $E \subset G$  that  $E$  supports a non-zero  $a \in C_r^*(G) \subset VN(G)$  (resp.  $\exists a \neq 0$  in  $C_r^*(G)$ ,  $a \in I(E)^\perp$ ).

## Corollary

Let  $f : G \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  be a measurable function and  $\varphi = Nf$ . Then

- (i) If  $E_f$  is not an  $M$ -set then  $\varphi$  is closable.
- (ii) If  $E_f$  is an  $M_1$ -set then  $\varphi$  is not closable.

- ▶ Every closed subset  $E$  of an amenable group of positive Haar measure is an  $M_1$ -set, as  $\chi_E d\mu$  is a non-zero measure supported in  $E$ .
- ▶ One point-set is not an  $M$ -set for non-discrete amenable group: as for  $E = \{e\}$ ,  $E^* = \{(x, x) : x \in G\}$ , and the last is not an operator  $M$ -set.
- ▶ Any countable closed subset of a non-discrete amenable group is not an  $M$ -set.



THANK YOU!